## **SPECIAL ARTICLE**

# Patient Satisfaction about Services of Immunization and Anti Rabies Clinic: A Study from Department of Community Medicine at Government Tertiary Care Hospital, Ajmer, Rajasthan, India.

# Dr. Renu Bedi<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Bharat Meharda<sup>2</sup>, Dr. Arshiya Bharti<sup>3</sup>, Dr. Devraj Rao<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Sr. Professor Deptt. of Community Medicine JLN Medical College Ajmer, Rajasthan.

<sup>2</sup>Assistant Professor Deptt. of Community Medicine JLN Medical College Ajmer, Rahasthan.

<sup>3</sup>Second year Resident Deptt. of Community Medicine JLN Medical College Ajmer, Rajasthan.

<sup>4</sup>First year Resident Deptt. of Community Medicine JLN Medical College Ajmer, Rajasthan.

#### **Abstract**

**Background:** Patient's satisfaction is of paramount importance for health care providers. Their aim is to provide the best quality of health care service to the patient. The purpose of health care services is to improve the health status of the population. Rabies is one of the most dreaded and fatal zoonotic disease.

**Methods:** Hospital based cross-sectional observational study carried out among patients who had animal bite and attended for anti rabies vaccination at Immunization and anti rabies clinic department of Community Medicine, J.L.N medical college & hospital Ajmer, Rajasthan, India during the period from 01/07/2018 to 31/07/18.

**Result:** A total of 294 respondents were interviewed. 158 (53.74%) respondent felt that comfort of waiting room was average & above. Majority 180 (61.22%) of respondent felt that examination room was comfortable. Majority 264 (89.79%) of respondent found that health care providers were average & above for answering queries.

**Conclusions:** Most of respondents showed overall satisfaction was average & above based on their experience related to skill and medical expertise of health care providers whereas it was poor for environmental factors and amenities at anti rabies clinic.

Keywords: Patient satisfaction, Health care providers, Quality, Services, Anti Rabies clinic.

#### Introduction:

Patient's satisfaction is of paramount importance for health care providers. Their aim is to provide the best quality of health care service to the patient. It is now a worldwide trend in the healthcare system to include subjective user satisfaction into the evaluation of quality of health care service provided. Satisfaction can be defined as the amplitude of an individual's experience compared with his expectations.1 In health care services patient satisfaction denotes the extent to which general health care needs of the clients are met to their requirements. Patients carry certain expectations before their visit and the resultant satisfaction or dissatisfaction is the outcome of their actual experience. Patient satisfaction is as important as other clinical health measures and is a primary means of measuring the effectiveness of health care delivery.<sup>2</sup>

Corresponding Author: Dr. Bharat Meharda. Email id: mehardabharat@gmail.com

The purpose of health care services is to improve the health status of the population. Health services should be comprehensive, accessible and acceptable, provide scope for community participation and available at a cost the community and country can afford.<sup>3</sup> Quality of services of an anti rabies clinic is very crucial for survival of a person who suffers from animal bite. These services also reflect the functioning of the hospital as OPD is visited by large section of community. Health care providers should be polite, cheerful, cooperative & efficient. The health care industry is undergoing a rapid transformation to meet the ever-increasing needs and demands of its patient. Hospitals today are shifting from viewing patients as uneducated and with little health care choice to present scenario of recognizing educated consumer who has many service demands and health care choices.<sup>4</sup>

Rabies is one of the most dreaded and fatal zoonotic disease, caused by rabies virus and it is completely preventable.<sup>5</sup> In India, dogs are responsible for about 97% of human rabies, disease is mainly transmitted by the bite and licks of a rabid dog. Fortunately, development of rabies can be prevented to a large extent if animal bites are managed appropriately and in time. In this regard the post-exposure treatment of animal bite cases is of prime importance. So patient's satisfaction and quality health services are essential for preventing the rabies.<sup>6</sup>

Unfortunately, In India measurement of patient satisfaction toward public health care services is still very much at infancy level. It is a performance indicator to know the quality of health care services.<sup>7</sup>

So present study was conducted to assess the patient's satisfaction among those who are attending anti rabies clinic under the department of Community Medicine of J.LN. Medical College & Hospital, Ajmer.

### **Objectives:**

- To assess the patient's satisfaction who are attending the anti rabies clinic for anti rabies vaccination.
- To obtain suggestion for improving services in anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. Medical College, Ajmer, Rajasthan, India.

#### **Materials and Methods:**

The city of Ajmer is located at centre of Rajasthan (India). It has an area of 8,481 km2 and population is almost 5,41,101 lakh. It was the hospital based cross-sectional observational study carried out among patients who had animal bite and attended for anti rabies vaccination at Immunization and anti rabies clinic department of Community Medicine, J.L.N medical college & hospital Ajmer, Rajasthan, India during the period from 01/07/2018 to 31/07/18. Simple random sampling technique was used to select patients.

New patients whose age was more than 18 years were interviewed after taking informed consent with the help of predesigned and pretested questionnaire with 26 aspects with respect to environmental factors, amenities, skill and medical expertise on 5 point graded scale worst, bad, average, good and excellent. The patients were told that the purpose of the study was to assess the patient satisfaction of services provided by immunization and anti rabies clinic so as to bring further improvement in services. Patient participation was voluntary. They were assured that anonymity and confidentiality will be maintained and participating in this study would have no effect on their treatment. Total 294 patients consented for study. Statistical analysis was done by using MS Excel software and results presented in figures and percentage.

#### Inclusion criteria:

 New patients whose age was more than 18 years and receiving anti rabies treatment at immunization and anti rabies clinic under the department of Community Medicine, J.L.N medical college & Hospital Ajmer, Rajasthan, India.

#### **Exclusion criteria:**

Patients not willing to participate and follow up patients were excluded from the study.

#### **Results:**

A total of 294 respondents were interviewed for various factors like environmental factors, amenities, skill of health care workers and medical expertise to know the respondent's satisfaction. Out 294 respondents of which 224 (76.19%) respondent were male and 70 (23.81%) respondents were females. Majority 177 (60.20%) were respondents in the age group of 18 - 45 years. Mean age of the respondents were 32.5. 181 (61.56%) respondents belonged to urban area. In the present study, majority of respondents 217 (73.80%) were belonged to Hindu religion followed by 51 (17.34%), 18 (6.12%), 8 (2.72%) were belonged to Muslim, Christian and others (Jain and Sikh) Religion respectively.

**Table 1** shows that majority 193 (65.64%) of the respondents felt that location of anti rabies clinic was bad & worst. 114 (38.77%) of respondent felt that the condition of building average & above. Just more than half that is 149 (50.68%) respondent felt that cleanliness of hospital was bad & worst. 158 (53.74%) respondent felt that comfort of waiting room was average & above. Majority 180 (61.22%) of respondent felt that examination room was comfortable. Majority 200 (68.02%) of respondent felt that injection room was comfortable. 1007 (48.93%) respondents found that overall patient satisfaction regarding environmental factors of immunization and anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. medical college & hospital, Ajmer was average & above.

**Table 2** shows that majority 220 (74.82%) of the respondents felt that time taken to get OPD slip average & above. Only 68 (23.12%) of the respondent found waiting time for consultation more than adequate and respondents grade it as bad & worst. Majority 225 (76.53%) respondents found availability of soap and water at immunization and anti rabies clinic was inadequate and they grade it as bad & worst. Only 52 (17.68%) respondents felt that privacy for washing wound at immunization and anti rabies clinic was average & above. 118 (40.13%) of respondents found that privacy of examination room was average & above and 154 (52.38%) respondents found that privacy of injection room was bad & worst. 178 (60.54%) respondents felt that waiting time of getting injection was average & above. 1003 (48.73%) respondents found that overall patient satisfaction regarding amenities at immunization and anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. medical college & hospital, Ajmer was average & above.

**Table 3** shows that majority 236 (80.27%) of the respondents found that health care providers were average & above for greetings on arrival. Majority 264 (89.79%) of respondent found that health care providers were average & above for helpfulness and friendliness. Majority of 244 (82.99%) respondent found that health care providers were average & above for willing to communicate. Majority 268 (91.15%) respondent found that health care providers were average & above for explain them about the disease. 247 (84.01%) respondents found that health care providers were average & above for explain them about the treatment. 273 (92.85%) respondent found that health care providers were average & above for advice for follow-up. Majority 1532 (86.84%) respondents found that overall patient satisfaction regarding skill of health care providers at immunization and anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. medical college & hospital, Ajmer was average & above.

**Table 4** shows that majority 269 (91.49%) of the respondents found that health care providers were average & above for taking history of disease. Majority 279 (94.89%) of respondent found that health care providers were average & above for guidance of wound washing. Only 10 (3.40%) of respondent found that health care providers were bad & worst for giving injection. Majority 254 (86.39%) of respondent found that health care providers were average & above for explaining prescription. Majority 264 (89.79%) of respondent found that health care providers were average & above for answering queries. Majority 1634 (92.63%) respondents found that overall patient satisfaction regarding medical expertise of health care providers at immunization and anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. medical college & hospital, Ajmer was average & above.

#### **Discussion:**

J.L.N. Medical College, Ajmer is tertiary health care centre of the Rajasthan state of western India. It runs its own immunization and anti rabies clinic since college was established. Good quality health care is a major concern of

health care providers all over the world. Patient satisfaction is an important tool to measure the quality of care provided to the patient. In this study, patient satisfaction was assessed in relation to services of immunization and anti rabies clinic with 26 aspects with respect to environmental factors, amenities, skill and medical expertise on 5 point graded scale worst, bad, average, good and excellent.

A study done by Kasunee C Kalubowila et al8 among 422 out-patients at Base Hospital Panadura Sri Lanka only 38 (14.67%) patients were less satisfied with location and study done by Jadhav S.B. et al9 had reported 31.4% participants reported inconvenience in finding concerned department. Where as in present study 193 (65.64%) of the respondents felt that location of anti rabies clinic was bad & worst. It may be because of J.L.N. Medical College & hospital, Ajmer was established in 1965 and hospital attach to it was built in British era, the immunization and anti rabies clinic still functioning in the same setup. With changes in time and growth of population although new clinical department have been setup but the location of immunization and anti rabies clinic is at same place therefore not upto the satisfaction of the respondents.

In present study just more than half that is 149 (50.68%) respondent felt that cleanliness of hospital was bad & worst similar findings found study done by Jawaharsk S. K.10 at a super specialty hospital in India had reported that 50% of the patients were not satisfied with regard to the cleanliness of the hospital. In another study done by Thelma Marwa11 in Namibia 49.30 were not satisfied with cleanliness. Whereas in another study done by Jadhav S.B. et al9 in the OPD of government medical college, Miraj distt. Sangli only 21.78 were not satisfied with cleanliness.

In present study 158 (53.74%) respondent felt that comfort of waiting room was average & above. Study done by Joshi S et al12 among 200 patients attending the OPD in Jaiprakash Hospital in Bhopal, India revealed that of the 78% patients were satisfied with the availability of good seating facilities whereas study done by Jadhav S.B. et al9 reported that 70.57% were found that seating arrangement in OPD was not good.

Study done by Mandokhail A. K. et al13 at the OPD in Banphaeo Community Hospital in Samut Sakhon Province, Thailand summarized satisfaction of patients on the registration services provided in the OPD. In another study done by Joshi S et al12 at the OPD in Jaiprakash Hospital in Bhopal, India revealed that 80% of patients were satisfied with the services delivered at the reception area and study done by Arvind Sharma et al2 in outpatient department of tertiary care hospital, Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh, India 92% of respondents were satisfied with time require to get OPD slip. Similar findings were observed in present study majority 220 (74.82%) of the respondents felt that time taken to get OPD slip average & above.

Study done by Kasunee C Kalubowila et al8 observed that 51.30% respondents felt poor satisfaction with the waiting time for consultation and in present study 23.12% of the respondent found waiting time for consultation more than adequate and respondents grade it as bad & worst. So necessary action should be taken to reduce the time spent by patients in waiting areas for consultation so patient satisfaction could improve. It may be improved by separate queues for old, new patients because new patients need more time for history and examination and appropriate distribution of patients among doctors.

Study done by Kasunee C Kalubowila et al8 32.30% respondent found that health care providers were not satisfactory for greetings on arrival whereas in present study majority 80.27% of the respondents found that health care providers were average & above for greetings on arrival. Study done by Arvind Sharma et al2 50% respondent that they understood their illness after consultation with doctor where as in present study majority 91.15% respondent found that health care providers were average & above for explaining them about the disease. Study done by Arvind Sharma et al2 62% respondent said doctor explain everything about treatment and were satisfied and it is similar to present study where 84.01% respondents found that health care providers were average & above for explain them about the treatment.

#### **Conclusion:**

Assessing satisfaction of patients is a simple and cost effective way for assessment of hospital services. The present study was carried out for measuring satisfaction of patients of immunization and anti-rabies clinic. Most of respondents showed overall satisfaction was average & above based on their experience related to skill and medical expertise of health care providers whereas it was poor for environmental factors and amenities at anti-rabies clinic.

#### **Recommendation:**

Anti rabies clinic services are an important part of health care services in hospital and there should be good quality services. Location and condition of building should be improved by constructing a new building following appropriate guideline. Kayakalp yojna should be implemented to improve cleanliness and raise patient's satisfaction. Waiting time for consultation is more than adequate and should be reduced by developing an app based online appointment system and increasing the OPD hours from the present 6 hours to 10 hours. Hospital should develop patient feedback system which is vital for good quality of services and will served as an important tool for improving the health services.

## **Acknowledgments:**

Authors thank the Medical Superintendent, Medical Office Incharge, health care providers and respondents of immunization and anti rabies clinic of J.L.N. Medical College & Hospital, Ajmer, Rajasthan, India for valuable contribution in the study.

#### **References:**

- 1. M Jawaid, I Ali, B Rizvi, H Razzak. Patient's satisfaction of surgical outpatient department using concise outpatient department user satisfaction scale. The internet journal of surgery 2009;22(1):1-5.
- 2. Arvind Sharma, P K Kasar, Richa Sharma. Patient satisfaction about hospital services: a study from the outpatient department of tertiary care hospital, Jabalpur, Madhya pradesh, India. National journal of community medicine June 2014;(5):199 -203.
- 3. A. H. Suryakantha text book of community medicine with recent advances. 4st ed. jaypee the health sciences publishers page 816.
- 4. Aanchal Jain, Neha Mishra, C. M. Pandey. A study to assess patient satisfaction in outpatient department of a tertiary care hospital in north india. International journal of community medicine and public health January 2016;3(1):328-334.
- 5. Dr. (Mrs.) Renu Bedi, Dr. D. K. Bedi, Mayank Bedi, Dr. B. L. Gupta. A review of the shifting attendance trend of the animal bite case in the anti rabies clinic of the J.LN. Medical College and Hospital, Ajmer. APCRI journal July 2008;10(1):23-25.
- 6. National Guidelines on Rabies Prophylaxis. National Centre for Disease Control (Directorate General of Health Services) 22 Sham Nath Marg, Delhi 110 054. Available from: http:// http://clinicalestablishments.gov.in/WriteReadData/238.pdf. [Last assessed on 2019 Fab 21].
- 7. Juliet Nabbuye-Sekandi, Fredrick E. Makumbi, Arabat Kasangaki, Irene Betty Kizza, Joshuatugumisirize, Edith Nshimye, Specioza Mbabali and David H. Peters, Patient satisfaction with services in outpatient clinics at mulago hospital, Uganda. International Journal for Quality in Health Care 2011; 23(5):516-523.
- 8. Kasunee C Kalubowila, Dinesha Perera, Inoka Senathilaka, Champika Alahapperuma, Ramani Devika Withana, Palitha Dharmabandhu Kapparage. Patient satisfaction of services at the out-patient department of Base Hospital Panadura, Sri Lanka. Journal of the College of Community Physicians of Sri Lanka 2017; 23(2):63-70.
- 9. S.B. Jadhav, G.S. Lokhande, J.D. Naik, S.S. Rajderkar, S.P. Suryavanshi, K.R. Bhoye. Measuring patient satisfaction towards quality of outpatient care: a part of Health Systems Research. International Journal of Recent Trends in Science And Technology 2011;1(3):96-103.

- 10. Jawahar SK. A Study on Out Patient Satisfaction at a Super Specialty Hospital in India. Internet Journal of Medical Update 2007;2(2):13-7.
- 11. Thelma Marwa, Kabwebwe Honoré Mitonga, Kathe Hofnie-Hoebes. Customers' satisfaction of the occupational therapy services in Namibia. International Journal of Community Medicine and Public Health Oct 2017;4(10):3542-3549.
- 12. Joshi S, Joshi MK. A study on patient satisfaction in outpatient department of secondary care hospital of Bhopal. International Journal of Community Medicine and Public Health 2017; 4(4):1141-1147.
- 13. Mandokhail AK, Keiwkarnka B, Ramasoota P. Patient satisfaction towards outpatient department (OPD) services of medicine in Banphaeo Community Hospital Samut Sakhon Province, Thailand Bangkok. Journal of Public Health and Development 2007;5(3):97-105.

Table 1: Distribution of responses of the respondents regarding environmental factors at immunization and anti rabies clinic (N-294)

|                           | RATING  |         |         |         |           |       |  |
|---------------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|-----------|-------|--|
| DETAILS                   | Worst   | Bad     | Average | Good    | Excellent | Total |  |
|                           | N       | N       | N       | N       | N         | N     |  |
|                           | (%)     | (%)     | (%)     | (%)     | (%)       | (%)   |  |
| Location of anti rabies   | 95      | 98      | 90      | 10      | 01        | 294   |  |
| clinic                    | (32.31) | (33.33) | (30.61) | (3.40)  | (0.34)    | (100) |  |
| Condition of building     | 70      | 110     | 108     | 06      | 00        | 294   |  |
|                           | (23.80) | (37.41) | (36.73) | (2.04)  | (00)      | (100) |  |
| Claanliness               | 58      | 91      | 95      | 48      | 02        | 294   |  |
| Cleanliness               | (19.72) | (30.95) | (32.31) | (16.32) | (0.68)    | (100) |  |
| Ease of moving around     | 85      | 100     | 95      | 14      | 00        | 294   |  |
|                           | (28.91) | (34.01) | (32.31) | (4.76)  | (00)      | (100) |  |
| Comfort of waiting room   | 41      | 95      | 120     | 35      | 03        | 294   |  |
|                           | (13.94) | (32.31) | (40.81) | (11.90) | (1.02)    | (100) |  |
| Comfort of examination    | 31      | 83      | 130     | 50      | 00        | 294   |  |
| room                      | (10.54) | (28.23) | (44.21) | (17.00) | (00)      | (100) |  |
| Comfort of injection room | 24      | 70      | 120     | 80      | 00        | 294   |  |
|                           | (8.16)  | (23.80) | (40.81) | (27.21) | (00)      | (100) |  |
| Total                     | 404     | 647     | 758     | 243     | 06        | 2058  |  |
|                           | (19.63) | (31.43) | (36.83) | (11.80) | (0.29)    | (100) |  |

Table-2- Distribution of responses of the respondents regarding amenities at immunization and anti rabies clinic (N-294)

|                               | RATING  |         |         |         |           |       |
|-------------------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|-----------|-------|
| DETAILS                       | Worst   | Bad     | Average | Good    | Excellent | Total |
|                               | N       | N       | N       | N       | N         | N     |
|                               | (%)     | (%)     | (%)     | (%)     | (%)       | (%)   |
| Time taken to get ODD alia    | 06      | 68      | 160     | 40      | 20        | 294   |
| Time taken to get OPD slip    | (2.04)  | (23.12) | (54.42) | (13.60) | (6.80)    | (100) |
| Maiting time for consultation | 11      | 57      | 110     | 75      | 41        | 294   |
| Waiting time for consultation | (3.74)  | (19.38) | (37.41) | (25.51) | (13.94)   | (100) |
| Availability of soan & water  | 70      | 155     | 49      | 15      | 05        | 294   |
| Availability of soap & water  | (23.80) | (52.72) | (16.66) | (5.10)  | (1.70)    | (100) |
| Privacy for washing wound     | 118     | 124     | 49      | 01      | 02        | 294   |
|                               | (40.13) | (42.17) | (16.66) | (0.34)  | (0.68)    | (100) |
| Privacy of examination        | 76      | 100     | 85      | 28      | 05        | 294   |
| room                          | (25.85) | (34.01) | (28.91) | (9.52)  | (1.70)    | (100) |
| Privacy of injection room     | 36      | 118     | 109     | 30      | 01        | 294   |
|                               | (12.24) | (40.13) | (37.07) | (10.20) | (0.34)    | (100) |
| Waiting time for getting      | 26      | 90      | 137     | 38      | 03        | 294   |
| injection                     | (8.84)  | (30.61) | (46.59) | (12.92) | (1.02)    | (100) |
| Total                         | 343     | 712     | 699     | 227     | 77        | 2058  |
|                               | (16.66) | (34.59) | (33.96) | (11.03) | (3.74)    | (100) |

Table 3: Distribution of responses of the respondents regarding skill of health care providers at immunization and anti rabies clinic (N-294)

|                            | RATING   |          |          |          |           |          |  |
|----------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-----------|----------|--|
| DETAILS                    | Worst    | Bad      | Average  | Good     | Excellent | Total    |  |
|                            | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%)  | N<br>(%) |  |
| Greeting on arrival        | 02       | 56       | 115      | 93       | 28        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.68)   | (19.04)  | (39.11)  | (31.63)  | (9.52)    | (100)    |  |
| Friendliness & helpfulness | 02       | 28       | 101      | 95       | 68        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.68)   | (9.52)   | (34.35)  | (32.31)  | (23.12)   | (100)    |  |
| Willingness to communicate | 01       | 49       | 96       | 100      | 48        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.34)   | (16.66)  | (32.65)  | (34.02)  | (16.32)   | (100)    |  |
| Explaining about disease   | 01       | 25       | 110      | 114      | 44        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.34)   | (8.50)   | (37.41)  | (38.77)  | (14.96)   | (100)    |  |
| Explaining about treatment | 01       | 46       | 115      | 85       | 47        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.34)   | (15.64)  | (39.11)  | (28.91)  | (15.98)   | (100)    |  |
| Advise for follow – up     | 01       | 20       | 102      | 115      | 56        | 294      |  |
|                            | (0.34)   | (6.80)   | (34.69)  | (39.11)  | (19.04)   | (100)    |  |
| Total                      | 08       | 224      | 639      | 602      | 291       | 1764     |  |
|                            | (0.45)   | (12.69)  | (36.22)  | (34.12)  | (16.49)   | (100)    |  |

Table 4: Distribution of responses of the respondents regarding medical expertise at immunization and anti rabies clinic (N-294)

|                         | RATING   |          |          |          |           |          |  |
|-------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-----------|----------|--|
| DETAILS                 | Worst    | Bad      | Average  | Good     | Excellent | Total    |  |
|                         | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%) | N<br>(%)  | N<br>(%) |  |
| Taking history          | 00       | 25       | 90       | 104      | 75        | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (8.50)   | (30.61)  | (35.67)  | (25.51)   | (100)    |  |
| Wound wash guidance     | 00       | 15       | 90       | 101      | 88        | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (5.10)   | (30.61)  | (34.35)  | (29.93)   | (100)    |  |
| Giving injections       | 00       | 10       | 66       | 128      | 90        | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (3.40)   | (22.44)  | (43.53)  | (30.61)   | (100)    |  |
| Explaining prescription | 00       | 40       | 71       | 103      | 80        | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (13.60)  | (24.14)  | (35.03)  | (27.21)   | (100)    |  |
| Answering queries       | 00       | 30       | 70       | 128      | 66        | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (10.20)  | (23.80)  | (43.53)  | (22.44)   | (100)    |  |
| Efficiency              | 00       | 10       | 60       | 111      | 113       | 294      |  |
|                         | (00)     | (3.40)   | (20.40)  | (37.75)  | (38.43)   | (100)    |  |
| Total                   | 00       | 130      | 447      | 675      | 512       | 1764     |  |
|                         | (00)     | (7.36)   | (25.34)  | (37.64)  | (29.02)   | (100)    |  |